

FINAL VERSION

REPORT OF THE BOARD OF SELECTMEN'S COMMITTEE ON
OVERNIGHT PARKING

JULY 27, 1988

Bruce Hamblin, Chairman
Arthur Casey
Rita Hamburg
Peg Hurley
Pauline Katz
Virginia LaPlante
Jeri Levitt
Joyce Malcolm
Brenda Soyer

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Summary of Recommendations	6
I Public Information	9
II Legislation	11
III Zoning	13
IV Licensing and Regulation	15
V Leased Municipal Lots	18
VI Private Parking Lots	24
VII Public lots	26
VIII Guest Parking	47
IX Administration of the Town's Parking Program	49
Appendix A Summary of Parking Questionnaire	
Appendix B Stanhope Waiting List Study	
Appendix C Projects Affecting Parking Facilities	
Appendix D State Funding for Parking Facilities	

INTRODUCTION

In April of 1987, three Town Meeting articles were submitted for the June Town Meeting.

The first article called for the development of a median-strip overnight parking program in non-commercial areas to service residents residing in neighborhoods abutting Beacon Street.

The second article called for a price-ceiling on private open-air parking lots as a condition for the granting of parking lot licenses.

The third article called for the Town to open all municipal lots for overnight parking and for the Town to assume the administration of the municipal lots leased to Stanhope Garage, Inc.

On May 6, 1987, the Board of Selectmen voted to create a Selectmen's Committee to study the three warrant articles and matters relative to the Town's overnight parking problem.

The members of the Selectmen's Committee were appointed to represent a cross section of viewpoints on these issues. The following members were appointed by the Board of Selectmen:

Arthur Casey, Town Meeting Member, Precinct 7

Bruce Hamblin, Planning Board Member

Rita Hamburg, Council on Aging Board Member

Peg Hurley, Precinct 15

Pauline Katz, Transportation Board Member

Virginia LaPlante, Town Meeting Member, Precinct 6

Jeri Levitt, Petitioner, Town Meeting Member, Precinct 10

Joyce Malcolm, Advisory Committee Member

Brenda Soyer, Town Meeting Member, Precinct 8, 1987-1988

The Town of Brookline has a long standing ban on overnight parking, which prohibits on-street parking town wide between the hours of 2:00 A.M. and 6:00 A.M.

Traditionally, Brookline's older buildings, parking structures and lots did provide sufficient parking for the residents of the Town. This was the case when the ban on overnight parking was instituted. Over the years, several factors have diminished the overall supply of parking spaces, namely; the subdividing of large apartments into several smaller apartments; increased population; increased car ownership; change

in employment patterns; and the loss of numerous open-air parking facilities and parking structures to commercial and residential development.

The Town has taken steps to address this shortage. Among these steps are the leasing of six municipal lots for overnight parking in 1985 and the 1987 amendments to the Zoning Ordinance which increased the parking requirements for apartment buildings.

In 1988, the Planning Board worked with and succeeded in persuading three developers to provide community overnight parking in their developments as a public amenity. We need to encourage Planning Board efforts to create more community overnight parking through the development review process. To date, the Planning Board's actions have helped create: 20 spaces off Webster Street; 50 spaces at 900 Commonwealth Avenue; and 50 spaces at 1244 Boylston Street.

The six Town lots provide resident overnight parking spaces by the month and guest overnight parking spaces by the night, for 257 vehicles. These lots located in Coolidge Corner, Brookline Village, and on School Street, are successful in providing some relief to residents and their guests. At the present time, these lots are filled nightly, with a waiting list for spaces.

The recommendations provided by this committee offer a number of alternatives for additional monthly and guest parking spaces in many neighborhoods throughout Brookline.

The Committee convened weekly from September 1987 through July 1988. It solicited the views of key Town personnel involved with overnight parking: Transportation Director, Jack Harris; Department of Public Works Director, Commissioner William Griffiths; Rent Control Board Acting Director, Frank Hooper and Counsel David Adams; Planning Board Staff, Ty Zeigler; Deputy Town Administrator, Brian F. Sullivan; and Police Chief, George Simard. It took testimony from Mr. Simon Goetlieb, owner of Stanhope Garage, Inc. It held four hearings throughout the Town and conducted two surveys, one based on questionnaires (See Appendix A), the other based on a telephone survey (See Appendix B). The proceedings of four public hearings were videotaped by Brookline Community Cable.

Our investigations brought forth several issues that concern Town residents: the lack of safety with individual parking arrangements; the problem of the high cost of parking in a limited market; and the distance many residents walk to reach their parking spaces.

Many people expressed the desire to maintain the Town's overnight parking ban, and to discourage the use of automobiles by upholding the Town's current overnight parking policy. Additionally, many people who attended the hearings felt that the Town's current overnight parking policy was not meeting their specific needs.

The Committee proposes recommendations in the areas of public information, legislation, zoning, licensing and regulation, and the use of municipal lots for public overnight parking. Recommendations are also made concerning additional public and private lots for resident overnight parking, guest parking, administration of the Parking Program, and new sources of funding to develop off street parking facilities. The Committee agreed on the majority of recommendations offered in this report. A proposal to develop median-strip parking on Beacon Street was defeated, and the proposal to use the Fuller Street lot for overnight parking was approved. Minority reports are included on both issues.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee is pleased to offer the following recommendations to the Board of Selectmen regarding the Town's overnight parking problems.

I. Public Information

1. Ensure that labeled "No Overnight Parking" signs are in place on all major access roads into Brookline.
2. Submit notices from Transportation Department preferably during summer, to local newspapers and other parking publications on parking regulations.
3. Improve and publicize Bulletin Board in Transportation Department to assist people seeking parking spaces, and owners who have parking spaces to rent.
4. Develop a brochure containing information about Brookline parking, including maps designating public parking lots, spaces for guest parking, and names, addresses, and phone numbers of people to call regarding citizens' complaints and parking information.
5. Utilize town bulletin boards for parking regulations and information.

II. Legislation

1. Require landlords, realtors, and sellers to inform renters and buyers of residential property about the overnight on-street parking ban; include information about overnight on-street parking ban on all leases and Purchase & Sale Agreements or on a separate attached sheet.
2. Require landlords to give priority to their tenants (rent-controlled and market) for available on-site parking spaces.
3. Require a minimum of one calendar month's notice for termination of parking space in licensed and unlicensed lots.

III. Zoning

1. Increase parking requirements for all new construction to provide overnight resident parking exclusively for community use.
2. Define additional parking in the zoning bylaws as a public benefit when granting variances and/or special permits in the additional parking to be available for community use.
3. Require the Planning Department to monitor all developments that receive variances and/or special permits for providing overnight community parking, and to report annually to the Planning Board.

IV. Licensing and Regulation

1. Minimum number of spaces required for licensing shall remain at four (4).
2. Bring unlicensed lots with four or more spaces into compliance with License Bylaw.
3. Require, as part of license application, information on: pricing, hours, lease arrangements, termination and renewal policies--to encourage affordability and fairness.
4. Require safe lighting as condition of license for Open Air Parking Lots, including walkways and alleys providing access thereto.
5. Adopt lighting standards for private lots and alleys.
6. Adopt and enforce annual inspection of alleys for lighting and parking layout, and require enforced, annual site inspection.
7. Require annual inspection with appropriate fee as a condition of re-licensing of private lots.
8. Require a minimum of one calendar month's notice for termination of parking space.
9. Prepare annual Selectmen's report analyzing data submitted for license applications.

V. Municipal lots leased to Stanhope Garage, Inc.

1. Town lots presently under private contract should remain under private contract.
2. Continue to require Massachusetts car registration to Brookline address for monthly overnight rentals.
3. The number of applicants on the waiting lists should be updated and submitted monthly to the Transportation Department for verification.
4. Submit rental lists monthly to Transportation Department to verify compliance with contractual allocation of monthly and guest spaces.
5. Discourage commuter use.
6. Analyze Centre Street West lot for maximum daytime use of spaces.

7. Revise and replace signs in the Babcock Street lot to encourage daytime hourly use.
8. Substantially increase the number of overnight monthly spaces and decrease the number of guest spaces.

VI. Private Parking Lots

1. Develop a program to encourage businesses to provide affordable overnight parking e.g. supermarkets, gas stations, funeral homes, churches, temples, banks, credit unions, hospitals, office buildings, restaurants, and retail stores.

VII. Public Lots

1. Negotiate with Brookline Housing Authority to secure modest number of nighttime parking spaces, such as those occupied by their daytime employees.

<u>90 Longwood Ave.</u> - (Morse)	4 spaces
<u>61 Park St.</u> - (O'Shea)	4 spaces
<u>50 Pleasant St.</u> - (Sussman)	4 spaces
2. Fuller Street lot (entire lot, either under a sticker plan or under contract to a lessor; (47 spaces), and small Webster Street lot (6-10 spaces).
3. Parks: Amory (6-10 spaces), Soule (5-12 spaces), Lynch (4-8 spaces).
4. Libraries: Coolidge Corner Branch - 6 spaces
5. Water Department (Netherlands Road - (8-10 spaces)

VIII. Guest Parking

1. Town Hall (20 spaces - Friday and Saturday nights only)
2. Other public or private lots

Schools: Heath (8 spaces), Lawrence (22 spaces),
Driscoll: (24 spaces), Baldwin (9 spaces)
Baker (10 spaces).
3. Libraries (Putterham Branch (8-10 spaces) - guest only)

IX. Administration of the Town's Parking Program

1. Recommend that the Selectmen exercise an oversight function to ensure that the departments are implementing the regulations and recommendations contained within this report.
2. Recommend that the Selectmen hire an employee to carry out the recommendations of this report.

I. PUBLIC INFORMATION

The Selectmen's Committee on Overnight Parking, concluded, during the course of the study, that it would be helpful for the Town to develop a public information program for the benefit of Town residents and people who are contemplating moving into the Brookline community.

The program would be informational for residents of the community and their guests regarding existing Town policies, locations of public monthly and guest accommodations, and a telephone information line which would be available to provide information and answer any questions residents may have.

The Committee felt the development of a public information program would have value to Brookline residents. The following proposals on the development of a detailed public information program were voted by the Committee:

1. Ensure that labeled "No Overnight Parking" signs are in place on all major access roads into Brookline.

2. Submit notices from Transportation Department, preferably during the summer, to local newspapers and other parking publications on parking regulations.
3. Improve and publicize Bulletin Board in Transportation Department to assist people seeking parking spaces, and owners who have parking spaces to rent.
4. Develop a brochure containing information about Brookline parking, including maps designating public parking lots, spaces for guest parking, and names, addresses, and phone numbers of people to call regarding citizens' complaints and parking information.
5. Utilize Town bulletin boards for parking regulations and information.

II. LEGISLATION

The Committee, in the course of its research on what action is needed by the Town, concluded that new legislation is necessary to ensure the proper implementation of the Committee's recommendations.

The Committee agreed that legislation was essential in three areas where local problems have been identified: 1) the failure of realtors and sellers of residential property, to inform the potential buyers and renters about the overnight parking ban, and the difficulty and cost of obtaining an overnight parking space; 2) the failure of landlords to give their tenants priority for on-site overnight parking facilities; and 3) failure of landlords to give adequate eviction notices for parking spaces.

The following are the Committee's recommendations on how to provide fair and reasonable solutions through legislation to protect Brookline's residents:

1. Require landlords, realtors, and sellers to inform renters and buyers of residential property about the overnight on-street parking ban; include information about overnight on-street parking ban on all leases and Purchase & Sale Agreements or on a separate

attached sheet.

2. Require landlords to give priority to their tenants (rent-controlled and market) for available on-site parking spaces.
3. Require a minimum of one calendar month's notice for termination of parking space in licensed and unlicensed lots.

III. Zoning

The Committee concluded after discussions with the Planning Board staff that the development review process can be used to help eliminate some of the parking deficiencies found throughout Brookline.

It is important that the Town encourage the use of new private developers to provide additional parking spaces to address the deficiency of overnight parking spaces.

Over the last 10-15 years, a significant amount of private overnight parking has disappeared due to residential and commercial development. (See Appendix C)

The following are recommendations on changes to the current zoning by-law and development review process:

1. Increase parking requirements for all new construction to provide overnight resident parking exclusively for community use.
2. Define additional parking in the zoning bylaw as a public benefit when granting variances and/or special permits, the additional parking to be available for community use.

3. Require the Planning Department to monitor all developments that receive variances and/or special permits for providing overnight community parking, and to report annually to the Planning Board.

IV. LICENSING AND REGULATION

The Committee, after careful study of the current licensing requirements and regulations concerning the enforcement of the Town's current overnight parking policy, concluded that several problems prevent the proper implementation and enforcement of an effective overnight parking policy. The Committee concluded that there is a need to bring the growing number of unlicensed parking lots into compliance with the current regulations. Additionally, the current system for licensing needs to be strengthened to address the issues of safety, affordability, accessibility and fair eviction policy.

Currently, the Town of Brookline requires operators of private open-air parking lots of four spaces or more to obtain a license to legally operate such open-air parking facilities.

It was the feeling of the Committee that the Town should require several conditions be met to ensure safety and fairness to all Town residents. The Committee recommends

that the following licensing requirements be added to the Town's current license application for private open-air parking lots:

1. Minimum number of spaces required for licensing shall remain at four (4).
2. Bring unlicensed lots with four or more spaces into compliance with License Bylaw.
3. Require as part of license application, information on: pricing, hours, lease arrangements, termination and renewal policies -- to encourage affordability and fairness.
4. Require safe lighting as condition of license for Open Air Parking Lots, including walkways and alleys providing access thereto.
5. Adopt lighting standards for private lots and alleys.
6. Adopt and enforce annual inspection of alleys for lighting and parking layout.
7. Require annual inspection with appropriate fee as a condition of re-licensing of private lots.
8. Require a minimum of one calendar month's notice for

termination of parking space.

9. Annual Selectmen's report, analyzing data submitted for license applications, shall be prepared.

V. MUNICIPAL LOTS LEASED TO STANHOPE GARAGE, INC.

In 1985, in an effort to increase the supply of overnight off-street parking spaces for Brookline residents and their guests, the Brookline Transportation Board agreed to permit the rental of overnight parking spaces on six town-owned parking lots. The Transportation Board concluded it was more efficient and cost effective to lease these lots to a private company to administer, than for the Town to operate the program and maintain the lots. The Town, through its lease agreement, retained control of the fees to be charged, the hours for overnight and daytime use, and the number of guest parking spaces as opposed to monthly spaces on each lot. A daytime rental program was established for merchants and their employees. A one-year trial period was agreed upon for the project, and the lots were leased to Stanhope Garage, Inc.. With the end of the trial period, a three year contract was negotiated with Stanhope Garage, Inc. to continue its lease with certain modifications regarding the hours and rates to be charged. Stanhope was to send in a list every month to the Transportation Department of the names and addresses of monthly renters and maintain a waiting list to be drawn upon as space became available. The present contract will expire in February 1989.

The leasing arrangement was controversial. The Transportation Board has spent considerable time studying other options including the transfer of the lots back to Town control. It has determined, however, that leasing is preferable.

During its deliberations, this Committee interviewed those most concerned with the leasing program and those who would be responsible to administer a new program if it were adopted. These include Jack Harris, the Transportation Director, Simon Gottlieb, Director of Stanhope Garage, Inc., George Simard, Police Chief, and William Griffiths, Director of the Department of Public Works.

Briefly there are specific advantages and disadvantages to be weighed in determining how best to administer the rental program on the town-owned parking lots. These are:

Advantages of the Leasing Arrangement

- . The Town receives the money "up front" and can count on a fixed income for the life of a contract.
- . The Town saves on personnel costs needed to administer the program.

- . The Town saves on maintenance costs including sweeping, snow removal, and repairs.
- . The Town sets the terms of rental arrangements.

Disadvantages of the Leasing Arrangement

- . The Town might receive more income if it administered the program itself.
- . The Town must rely on private companies to make bids to lease the lots and this has not been a program that has attracted many bidders.
- . The Town must exercise careful oversight to ensure that the terms of the contract are being carried out.
- . The Town must insure that the ratio of spaces allocated for monthly and guest parking as stipulated in the contract is maintained.

Problems with Current Arrangements

There are some problems with the leasing program concerning enforcement and daytime use. Some of the terms of the contract with Stanhope Garage, Inc. are not being met in large part because the contract is not being monitored affectively as follows:

- . Stanhope has not consistently submitted lists of renters on a monthly basis as required.
- . The waiting list is very long. According to the owner of Stanhope Garage, Inc. the waiting list peaks at approximately 200 during the fall and gradually declines to under 75 in late spring and during the summer. There is no apparent system or accountability to the waiting list to guarantee the people on the waiting list are given spaces when they become available. Some people have been on the list for two years.
- . There is evidence to suggest that the number of monthly rental spaces has been reduced and the number of guest parking spaces has been increased in spite of the waiting list for monthly rental spaces. This reallocation of spaces has been

particularly significant at the Kent-Webster lot. The committee found that at one point during the last year, the required number of monthly overnight spaces had been reduced from 31 to 4.

Concerns were expressed that commuters are renting spaces daily and that lot signs discourage shoppers from parking there. There were complaints from residents that the Centre Street West lot, which has a gate and is used exclusively by monthly renters both day and night, is not fully utilized during the day. There was also concern that night time parkers do not always leave promptly at 8:00 A.M.

The Committee makes the following recommendations:

1. Town parking lots presently under private contract should remain under private contract.
2. Continue to require Massachusetts car registration to a Brookline address for monthly overnight rentals.
3. The number of the applicants on the waiting lists should be updated and submitted monthly to the Transportation Department for verification.
4. Submit rental lists monthly to Transportation Department to verify compliance with contractual

allocation of monthly and guest spaces.

5. Discourage commuter use.
6. Analyze Centre Street West lot for maximum daytime use of spaces.
7. Revise and replace signs in the Babcock Street lot to maximize daytime hourly use.
8. Substantially increase the number of overnight monthly spaces and decrease the number of guest spaces.

VI. PRIVATE PARKING LOTS

The Committee proposes a joint program between the Town of Brookline and the business community to develop a Community Parking Program. This cooperative venture would assist in providing some additional off-street parking spaces for overnight parking.

Many businesses have private parking areas which are used primarily during the day and are usually unused at night. It is proposed that through the establishment of a Town/Business Venture selected spaces in private lots be offered for overnight parking.

The parking situation in Brookline affects both the merchants and residents alike. It is suggested that a cooperative relationship now, between the public and private sector could lay the groundwork for future solutions in the establishment of new parking programs for Brookline.

The Committee looks to the Selectmen and the business community to establish a cooperative parking enterprise which will be of mutual benefit to the business community and the residents.

The Committee makes the following recommendation:

1. That the Town develop a program to encourage businesses to provide affordable overnight parking e.g. supermarkets, gas stations, funeral homes, churches, temples, banks, credit unions, hospitals, office buildings, restaurants, and retail stores.

VII. PUBLIC LOTS

In addition to the six town owned municipal parking lots which are currently used for overnight parking, other public lots are available which could be used for resident overnight parking. These include the two unused municipal lots, Fuller Street and the small Webster Street lot, the Brookline Housing Authority lots; Park and Recreation lots, Library lots, and the Water Department lot. The fee schedule should be tied to the leased municipal lots schedule. The hours should be determined by the user agency, depending on the needs of that site.

These sites are recommended because they are town owned and their use would set an example for the private sector. In addition, they are located throughout the Town and could serve a number of neighborhoods. We are recommending only partial use of these lots, so as not to impinge on their primary use.

It is suggested that if these lots are operated under a sticker plan, a comparison could be made by the Town of operating lots under a leased program or a sticker program. Small Webster Street Lot - There are 14 spaces in the small Webster Street Lot, which is conveniently located. The Commilttee recommends 6-10 spaces be made available.

We recommend use of the following lots for overnight resident parking:

1. Brookline Housing Authority Lots - 90 Longwood Avenue, 4 spaces; 61 Park Street, 4 spaces; 54 Pleasant Street, 4 spaces
2. Park and Recreation Lots - Amory Park, 6-10 spaces; Soule Recreation Center, 5-12 spaces; Lynch Recreation Center, 4-8 spaces
3. Library Lots - Coolidge Corner Branch, 6 spaces
4. Water Department Lot - Netherlands Road, 8-10 spaces
5. Municipal lots - Small Webster Street, 6-10 spaces; Fuller Street, 47 spaces

MAJORITY REPORT ON FULLER STREET LOT

There are 47 parking spaces available at this lot. There are additional spaces for handicapped parking, dumpsters, and deliveries. Objections to the use of this lot were that Temple Kehillath Israel and businesses in the area might be adversely affected. Monitoring of this lot showed that it is most heavily used during daytime hours when businesses in the area are open. It is nearly empty during the early morning and evening hours.

It would serve the residents of North Brookline if it were opened for overnight parking. At present some residents are forced to share driveways where as many as 3 or 4 other cars are parked making it necessary to move several cars in order to gain access to one's own car. In addition, fees charged by businesses in the area are often very high. For example, the monthly fee for parking at the gasoline station on Harvard Street is \$90.00 a month.

A majority of the Committee recommends the entire lot be opened for overnight resident parking either under a sticker plan or contract to a lessor.

Summary of Public Lot Information

<u>Location</u>	<u>Recommended Number of spaces Maximum Use</u>	<u>Recommended Number of spaces Minimum Use</u>
Fuller Street	47	47
Brookline Housing Authority	12	12
Webster Street	10	6
Amory Park	10	6
Soule Center	12	5
Lynch Center	8	4
Coolidge Corner Library	6	6
Water Department	10	8
	<hr/>	<hr/>
Total	115	94

<u>Estimated Income</u>	<u>Estimated Income</u>
115	94
<u>x30</u>	<u>x30</u>
3450 month	2820 month
<u>x12</u>	<u>x12</u>
41,400 annual	33,840 annual

Estimated Expenses

Salary of Administrator	\$23,000
Stickers	1,000
Quarterly Billing	350
Publicity - Brochure	<u>1,600</u>
	25,950

MINORITY REPORT ON FULLER STREET

Many factors mitigate against using the Fuller Street lot for overnight parking. The Fuller Street lot services two of the busiest blocks of the food service sector of Brookline. Among the successful stores on these blocks are many that supply kosher meat for the Jewish community in Brookline and elsewhere, including three Jewish bakeries, the only Jewish fish store, a catering business, and the only kosher dairy restaurant in the Brookline area. It also has the active Israel Book Shop. Other food stores include Bread and Circus and a brand-new upscale restaurant, the Harvard Street Grill, which is open from 5:30 to 10:00 P.M. on Monday through Thursday, and from 5:30 to 11:00 P.M. on Friday and Saturday. The parking lot behind these and other businesses was surely a consideration in their decision to settle in this location.

The Fuller Street lot is also next to Temple Kehillath Israel, a widely used temple, with an early-morning nursery School, Hebrew Schools, evening lectures, social functions, and religious functions, such as weddings and bar mitzvahs. The temple is in use seven days a week and many nights a week.

The same reasons that argue against use of the median strip for overnight parking argue against use of the Fuller Street lot. Under Town supervision, a program of overnight parking in the Fuller Street lot would entail prohibitive costs of administration, cleaning, and snow removal, without any comparable profits. The lot would deteriorate in appearance. Enforcement of departure of nighttime parkers so as to allow access for daytime parkers would be impossible. There would be no way to tell whether overstaying nighttime parkers had a legitimate daytime reason for parking in the lot. As a result, the lot would gradually become monopolized by nighttime use, effectively eliminating its present multiplicity of uses both day and evening.

No evidence has shown that more spaces are needed in this neighborhood than in any other neighborhood. This neighborhood is already being served by the bulk of the spaces in the Stanhope managed public lots. The Town should not create new problems by overburdening a lot, like the Fuller Street lot, which already serves a multitude of uses. Instead, the Town should concentrate on the many other measures recommended in this report in order to satisfy the overnight parking need.

The heaviest business time of the week in this neighborhood is Sunday morning, when the lot needs to be vacant. The largest population of Jewish senior citizens in Brookline is concentrated in the North Brookline area, and any change in the business stores in this neighborhood would dramatically change their lives.

Rita Hamburg

Virginia LaPlante

MAJORITY REPORT ON BEACON STREET MEDIAN STRIP PARKING

Two types of plans for overnight parking on the Beacon Street median strip were studied - permit parking and meters. Both plans would provide 313 spaces from Ayer Road to Dean Road; Westbourne Terrace to Marion Street and Powell Street to Carlton Street.

The majority members of the Selectmen's Parking Committee rejected these proposals for the following reasons:

Cost

A median strip parking program would require additional personnel for administration, cleaning, plowing and enforcement. It would require the purchase of new equipment. Also required would be billing and record-keeping for 313 individuals, including waiting lists and handling complaints.

Safety

Parking on the median strip will affect safety. Parked cars provide a hiding place for potential offenders making it unsafe for parkers and pedestrians. The area could become a dumping ground for abandoned cars.

Enforcement

Enforcement requires additional personnel and constant monitoring. The present two-hour parking limit is not uniformly enforced. The requirement that people be out of their space at 8:00 A.M. would add another unenforceable regulation. Failure to observe this regulation and vacate an overnight slot (mornings, vacations, holidays, illness) would reduce the availability of daytime slots.

Lack of enforcement would also encourage commuter parking, further reducing the availability of daytime slots. The 313 new median strip parkers, added to the present 257 Stanhope parkers would create a total of 507 residents seeking daytime spaces on Brookline streets in violation of the 2 hour ban. To tow those violators would be labor-intensive, and requiring special police details.

Environment

The Town policy regarding overnight parking is serving the Town well in terms of cleanliness, snow removal, and pollution control. Opening up the median strip to overnight parking would encourage residents to acquire more cars, thereby adding to pollution and defeating one of the purposes of the overnight parking ban.

Outcome

The character of Beacon Street would be changed. Historically, it is an avenue of mixed uses --- commercial, professional, and residential. Overnight parking on the Median strip would upset this delicate balance.

Many people move to Brookline in order to use public transportation. The infusion of hundreds of new overnight parking spaces on Beacon Street would attract more car owners. For example, the Stanhope arrangement was meant to satisfy a parking demand, but has led to more demand. Opening up the median strip would lead to further demand for use of the median strip and, ultimately, to on-street parking throughout the Town.

Income and expenses of Median Strip Overnight Parking

Income

1. Permits @ \$30/mo. x 313 spaces (85% capacity) \$112,680

Expenses

1. Administration

G-5 senior clerk steno @ \$21,425 +50% benefits	32,137
Stickers	3,000
Billing Forms (400 x 4 quarters x \$1.00	1,600
Publicity (printed matter)	2,000
Office equipment	?
Phone	?

2. Signs

100 @\$125 each, installed	12,500
Maintenance	?

3. Cleaning (town employees)

4 sweepers @ \$337/day, 2x/wk, 45 wk/yr	
+50% benefits	45,476
1 daily litter patrol @ \$21,895/yr +50% benefits	32,843
Complete painting one per yr.	2,333
Supplies and equipment	?

4. Snow plowing (town employees)

1 front-end loader @ \$30/hr x 8 hrs/storm x 12 storms/yr	2,880
1 operator @\$10,917/yr, 8 rs + benefits x 12 storms/yr	1,572
1 sanding truck @\$21/hr x 3hrs/storm x 20 storms/yr	1,260
2 operators @ \$66/storm +to% benefits x 20 storms/yr	1,980
18 tons sand/salt @ \$30/ton x 20 storms/yr	10,800
Supplies	?

5. Snow Removal (contractual)

1 loader, 3 trucks, 1 dozer, 1 foreman, 2 hand shovelers, 1 police detail for 8 hrs. (\$3,842) x 12 storms/yr	46,104
---	--------

6. Enforcement

2 meter monitors @ \$12.20/hr x 15 hrs/wk +50%	
x 52wks	19,032
2 meter monitors weekends @ time 1/2 (\$18.30)	
x 6hrs +50% x 52	8,565
Uniforms (4) @ \$1500	6,000
1 police sergeant for towing @\$33,181 + 50%	48,271
Uniform	3,000
1 police detail weekends @ \$25/hr x 16hrs x 52	23,920

7. Insurance

Town can disclaim liability	0
Possibility of litigation	?
	<hr/>
	\$ 305,273
Total expenses	\$ 305,273
Total income	112,680
Total deficit	<hr/>
	-\$ 192,593

MINORITY REPORT ON BEACON STREET MEDIAN STRIP

Although there was consensus among members of the Selectmen's Parking Commission on virtually all recommendations included in this report, the proposal to use residential portions of the Beacon Street median strip for a pilot permit parking program was a significant exception. The Commission was narrowly divided on the issue, voting 5 to 4 against the plan. The four members in favor of the proposal, all of whom live in North Brookline and have first-hand experience of that area's acute need for off-street parking, would like to explain why they have concluded that overnight use of residential portions of the median strip is the most practical means of ameliorating the shortage. We urge the Board of Selectmen and the Transportation Board to launch such a program.

The Problem

The reasons for the shortage of off-street parking can be briefly summarized. Between 1970 and 1986 the number of cars registered in Brookline rose by more than 29%. This does not include those cars kept in Brookline much of the year but registered in other states. During the same period a large number of the parking lots used by residents were lost to residential and commercial development. A list compiled by the

Planning Director of projects begun since 1981 reveals an absolute loss of some 300 spaces. (See Appendix C) Exacerbating the problem is the fact that the zoning requirements for multiple dwelling unit buildings was, until last year, only 1.2 parking spaces per unit. This meant that at the same time existing residents lost their parking spaces to development, the residents moving into that development seldom had sufficient parking on site. The same zoning standard applied to sub-divisions of existing buildings. One result was the overflow of Brookline cars into Brighton streets at night, which grew so prevalent that Brighton instituted a resident parking program to protect its citizens' parking.

Two studies completed in 1987, the Planning Department's "Residential Parking Survey" of March 1987 and the "Beacon Street Corridor Parking Study" of April 1987 highlight the problem. The Planning Department's study persuaded the Planning Board to recommend, and the 1987 Annual Town Meeting to adopt, a more generous parking requirement for new, multiple unit and commercial construction. The requirement has been increased for the former from 1.2 spaces per unit to between 1.5 and 1.7 spaces, depending on the size of the apartment.

The "Beacon Street Corridor Parking Study" was undertaken for the Town by Vanasse Hanagen Brustlin, Inc., private consultants to examine daytime parking in Coolidge Corner and Washington Square. They had this comment about overnight parking in these areas:

...based on a preliminary analysis of private parking supply for multiple dwelling unit buildings only, it is clear that the private supply of overnight parking spaces is either not adequate to meet the demand or is priced as to encourage people to try to get a monthly space in one of the public off-street facilities. As mentioned previously, there are 60 names on the waiting list for a monthly space in one of the public off-street lots in Coolidge Corner.

(pp.25-6)

The present Parking Commission's own survey found that of 317 respondents some 56 parked on the streets of Brookline, Brighton/Allston or elsewhere because they were unable to find affordable off-street parking in Brookline.

These findings and our own personal experience have led us to conclude that there is a severe shortage of off-street parking in Brookline, especially in North Brookline where many older buildings have no parking spaces at all, and where most of the new residential development and loss of parking lots has taken place.

Helpful but inadequate steps

The Planning Board is to be commended for its excellent new construction requirements, survey of residential parking and the new, more realistic provisions for parking spaces it has led the Town to adopt. But unfortunately the new regulations come after

years of new developments and conversions authorized without sufficient parking facilities. The new rules will undoubtedly help keep the situation from getting worse but do nothing to make up for the loss of parking lots or the hundreds of buildings built before 1987 whose residents are left without adequate parking.

Additional Spaces in Town Lots

We heartily endorse the recommendations of this Parking Committee to open up additional spaces in town-owned parking lots for residents and their guests. But while the proposal to permit overnight guest parking on weekends in the Town Hall and school parking lots will, if implemented, provide guest facilities throughout the Town for the first time, the new spaces proposed for resident parking would only total between 94 and 115 spaces. The bulk of these are concentrated in the Coolidge Corner area with very few spaces in other areas and none at all accessible to residents of Washington Square or Cleveland Circle. This number will not adequately deal with the shortage. If the Town is to maintain its ban on overnight parking on streets a reasonable stock of affordable off-street parking is essential.

Use of Business Parking Lots

The recommendation of this Parking Committee that the Board of Selectmen initiate a program to encourage local businesses with parking lots to lease spaces overnight to residents is a

fine idea, but past experience with this sort of effort does not encourage optimism. Three years ago, the Transportation Board attempted just such a program without success. Moreover, business lots tend to be in commercial, rather than residential areas and none are available in the Washington Square area where off-street parking is in very short supply.

In summary, none of the steps already taken by the Town to ease the off-street parking situation, or the other alternatives proposed in this report offer any hope of substantial relief to Brookline residents in the near future. It is for this reason that we strongly recommend a permit parking program for overnight resident parking on RESIDENTIAL PORTIONS of the Beacon Street median strip. Would the majority of Brookline residents endorse such a program? The Planning Department's survey of residential parking reports:

Of the respondents who commented on the ban, 83% were favor of either lifting it or instituting a limited resident parking sticker program. (p.6)

We urge the adoption of a limited resident parking sticker program.

The advantages of the program we propose are outlined below, followed by a careful estimate of costs and revenues based upon figures presented to the Parking Commission by the Transportation Director, Jack Harris, and interviews with Police Chief Simard and the Commissioner of Public Works, William Griffiths.

Pilot Overnight Permit Parking

A permit parking program allowing Brookline residents to lease space overnight (from 6:00 PM to 8:00 AM) along selected residential portions of the Beacon Street median strip is the most practical, economic, and immediate means at hand to help Brookline citizens find off-street overnight parking. And it would afford the Town a new source of revenue.

The advantages of such a program are:

- . The Beacon Street median strip passes through the areas of Town with the most acute parking shortage.
- . Use of only residential areas of the median strip for overnight parking will not interfere with access to commercial areas. On-street parking would be available after 6:00 PM to accommodate the patients visiting any doctors whose offices were opposite permit parking areas.
- . Beacon Street is well lighted for safe access at night.
- . Cars parked along the median strip will not interfere with the passage of emergency vehicles.
- . It will provide a new source of revenue to the Town which gets no income now from this area after 6:00 PM.
- . The cost of instituting the program and maintaining it is minimal. (See below)
- . No other program, with the exception of a multiple story garage, will help the residents of the Washington Square area or Cleveland Circle.

- . The area is easy to police.
- . The addition of a reasonable number of affordable parking spaces will help moderate prices charged elsewhere in Town more simply and effectively than establishing price controls.
- . Sweeping and snow removal can be handled by prohibiting parking at specific times, e.g. 8:00 AM-10:00 AM on certain days in the first instance and at times of snow emergency in the latter case. These arrangements will mean, according to the Commissioner of Public Works, that there will be no additional cost for cleaning over present arrangements.
- . The terms of the program can easily be enforced by ticketing, towing, and finally removing parking privileges of frequent violators.

Income and Expenses

Income

1. 313 spaces at \$30 per month* \$112,680 per yr.

Expenses

1. Administration

Parking Manager half of person's time	22,500
(\$45,000 salary and benefits)	
Stickers @ \$1.00 allowing for turnover	400
Billing forms (400 x 4 quarters x \$1.00)	1,600
Publicity (printed matter)	800

2. Signs

100 signs @ \$125 each, installed	12,500
(this is a one time expense)	

3. Cleaning and Plowing--no appreciable difference (according to Commissioner of Public Works)

4. Enforcement--no appreciable difference (according to Chief of Police)

5. Insurance, can disclaim liability 0

\$37,800

Revenue annually less initial cost	74,880
------------------------------------	--------

If subtract one-time cost of signs ANNUAL REVENUE	87,380
---	--------

* A rental rate of \$30 coincides with that charged in the lots leased Stanhope Garage, Inc.

** List of areas that would constitute a possible program to provide spaces.

Ayer Road to Dean Road/Westbourne Terrace to Marion Street/
Street to Carlton Street.

Bruce Hamblin
Jeri Levitt
Joyce Malcolm
Brenda Soyer

GUEST PARKING

The availability of facilities to accommodate overnight guests are scarcer in Brookline. While the Committee was not charged to make recommendations on guest parking, the Committee felt that the issue of overnight and daytime guest parking should be addressed.

Because the few existing guest parking facilities are generally located in North Brookline and Brookline Village, the Committee has developed a guest parking program that would make overnight guest spaces available in several neighborhoods.

The proposed program utilizes existing public off-street parking facilities that are not utilized during weekend hours. The hours of use would be from Friday evening at 6:00 PM to Sunday at 12:00 noon. The fees should be tied to those set for overnight guest parking in the leased lots. If this program is adopted in its entirety, the number of spaces made available will be approximately 100 spaces.

One option for operation of the program is a sticker program using cards that bears the date of the proposed day of use. Stickers could be purchased for a nightly fee from the Brookline Police Department.

The Committee recommends the following locations be used for guest parking:

1. Town Hall parking lot - 20 spaces
2. Schools - Heath - 8 spaces; Lawrence - 22 spaces
Baldwin - 9 spaces; Baker - 10 spaces
Driscoll - 24 spaces
3. Libraries - Putterham Branch - 8-10 spaces

IX. ADMINISTRATION OF THE TOWN'S PARKING PROGRAM

The Committee recommends that the Selectmen exercise an oversight function to ensure that Town departments implement the regulations and recommendations contained within this report.

The Committee further recommends that the Selectmen hire an employee to carry out the recommendations of this report. The salary for this new position would be gained from the income generated from additional parking revenue from the several locations recommended for parking use in this report.

The following are some of the duties an administrator would perform:

- . Develop and administer the guest parking program.
- . Develop and administer the expanded program of overnight parking use in the public lots.
- . Negotiate with businesses to develop a community parking program utilizing lots owned by the business community.
- . Review applications for private lot licenses.
- . Develop and implement a public information program containing information about parking in Brookline.
- . Monitor the leased lots to ensure that the operators are meeting all of their contractual obligations.
- . Handle inquiries and complaints from residents concerning safety, pricing, and location of available overnight resident and guest parking.

The Committee believes that under its current structure the Transportation Department does not have the staff to effectively manage an expanded parking program as outlined in this report.

Our study of the parking problems in Brookline has persuaded the Committee that a successful parking program needs effective monitoring and a tight administrative structure. The person in charge should give full attention to the responsibilities of Brookline's parking program. Many of the inequities and problems identified could be improved with effective enforcement and management.

Appendixes

- A. Summary of parking questionnaire
- B. Stanhope waiting list study
- C. Projects affecting parking facilities
- D. State funding for parking facilities

APENDIX A - SUMMARY OF PARKING QUESTIONNAIRE

Overall Responses

1. Do you currently have an overnight parking space?

BROOKLINE	ELSEWHERE	NO	NO RESPONSE (NR)	TOTAL
317 (77%)	10 (2%)	74 (18%)	12 (3%)	413 (100%)

2. Approximately how far do you walk from your parking space to your home? Needs further quantification - see page 3.

3. Do you feel your parking arrangements are safe?

YES	NO	NR	TOTAL
214 (52%)	158 (38%)	41 (10%)	413

4. Would you rent an overnight space on the Beacon Street median strip if it were available?

YES	NO	NR	MAYBE	TOTAL
160 (40%)	167 (40%)	43 (10%)	43 (10%)	413

5. Which type of residence do you live in?

RENT CONT.	APT.	NON-RCA	CONDO	HOUSE	NR	TOTAL
161 (39%)		83 (20%)	88 (21%)	49 (12%)	32 (8%)	413

5a. Is there parking available where you live?

YES	NO	NR	LIMITED	TOTAL
125 (30%)	214 (52%)	29 (7%)	45 (11%)	413

6. How much do you pay for your overnight parking space?

(of 327 responding)

	24 HR SPACE			OVER NIGHT ONLY NR	
NR - 3	\$55.00 - 2	\$100.00 - 1	\$ 0.00 - 5		24
\$ 0.00 - 58	\$60.00 - 28	\$105.00 - 1	\$25.00 - 2		
\$25.00 - 19	\$65.00 - 10	\$125.00 - 1	\$30.00 - 5, \$35.00 - 1		
\$30.00 - 8	\$68.00 - 1	\$150.00 - 4	\$40.00 - 6, \$45.00 - 2		
\$35.00 - 5	\$70.00 - 5		\$50.00 - 10		
\$38.00 - 1	\$75.00 - 15		\$60.00 - 5		
\$40.00 - 33	\$80.00 - 4		\$70.00 - 2		
\$45.00 - 11	\$88.00 - 1		\$75.00 - 3		
\$50.00 - 43	\$90.00 - 5		\$80.00 - 2		
			\$125.00 - 1		

6a. Is it a 24 hour space?

YES	NO	NR	TOTAL
259 (79%)	44 (14%)	24 (7%)	327

6b. Is it indoor?

YES	NO	NR	TOTAL
44 (13%)	185 (57%)	98 (30%)	327

Question #2 will need some standardization in order to be quantified. Units of distance were given in blocks, feet, yards, miles, minutes and several unquantifiable terms such as "far"

(See appendices A, B, and C.) Several conversion factors are given below.

4 FEET/SECOND*
 560 FEET/BLOCK **
 3 FEET/YARD
 5280 FEET/MILE
 60 SECONDS/MINUTE

*This is the normal walking speed assumed in engineering design
 **This figure was derived by taking the average distance between blocks for Beacon Street inbound and outbound from St. Mary's Street to Cleveland Circle (See appendix D.)

Detailed Responses

1. Do you currently have an overnight parking space in Brookline?

413 responses ----	YES	NO	NO RESPONSE (NR)
	317 (77%)	89 (22%)	7 (1%)

Of the 317 "YES" respondents to question 1:

Distance walked to parking space: See Appendix A.

	YES	NO	NR
Feel parking arrangements are safe	205 (65%)	107 (34%)	5 (1%)

Would rent an overnight space on Beacon Street median	YES	NO	NR	MAYBE
	110 (35%)	151 (48%)	19 (6%)	37 (11%)

Live in the following types of residences:

RENT CONT. APT (RCA)	NON-RCA	CONDO.	HOUSE	NR
121 (38%)	60 (19%)	81 (26%)	47 (15%)	8 (2%)

	YES	NO	NR	LIMITED
Have parking available at residence	122 (38%)	160 (51%)	6 (2%)	29 (9%)

	YES	NO	NR
Have a 24 hours space	250 (79%)	43 (14%)	24 (7%)
Have an indoor space	44 (14%)	178 (56%)	95 (30%)

Cost for overnight parking space
(of 293 responding)

FOR 24 HOUR SPACES

FOR OVER-NIGHT SPACES

NR - 2	\$ 68.00 - 1	\$ 0.00 - 5
\$ 0.00 - 58	\$ 70.00 - 5	\$ 25.00 - 2
\$ 25.00 - 19	\$ 75.00 - 13	\$ 30.00 - 5
\$ 30.00 - 8	\$ 80.00 - 3	\$ 35.00 - 1
\$ 35.00 - 5	\$ 88.00 - 1	\$ 40.00 - 6
\$ 38.00 - 1	\$ 90.00 - 5	\$ 45.00 - 2
\$ 40.00 - 32	\$100.00 - 1	\$ 50.00 - 10
\$ 45.00 - 11	\$105.00 - 1	\$ 60.00 - 5
\$ 50.00 - 41	\$125.00 - 1	\$ 70.00 - 2
\$ 55.00 - 2	\$150.00 - 3	\$ 75.00 - 2
\$ 60.00 - 27		\$ 80.00 - 2
\$ 65.00 - 10		\$125.00 - 1

Of the 89 respondents answering "NO" to question 1

1a. Do you currently have an overnight parking space Elsewhere?

YES	NO	NR
10 (11%)	74 (83%)	5 (6%)

Of the 10 "YES" responses to question 1a:

Distance walked to parking space: See Appendix B.

	YES	NO	NR
Feel parking arrangements are safe	1 (10%)	9 (90%)	0 (0%)
Would rent an overnight space on Beacon Street median	7 (70%)	2 (20%)	1 (10%)

Live in the following types of residences:

	RCA	NRCA	CONDO	HOUSE	NR
	6 (60%)	3 (30%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (10%)

	YES	NO	NR	LIMITED
Have parking available at residence	0 (0%)	9 (90%)	0 (0%)	1 (10%)

	YES	NO	NR
Have a 24 hours space	9 (90%)	1 (10%)	0 (0%)
Have an indoor space	0 (0%)	7 (70%)	3 (30%)

Cost for overnight parking space

FOR 24 HOUR SPACES

FOR OVERNIGHT SPACES

NR - 1
 \$ 40.00 - 1
 \$ 50.00 - 2
 \$ 60.00 - 1
 \$ 75.00 - 2
 \$ 80.00 - 1
 \$150.00 - 1

\$75.00 - 1

Of the 74 "NO" responses to question 1a:

6 were not further identifiable

12 had no car

56 parked on street in Brookline/Brighton/Allston, etc.

Of the 56 respondents parking on street

Distance walked to park: See Appendix C.

	YES	NO	NR	
Feel parking arrangements are safe	8 (14%)	42 (75%)	6 (11%)	
Would rent an over-night space on Beacon Street median	39 (70%)	10 (18%)	1 (2%)	MAYBE 6 (10%)

Live in the following types of residences

RCA	NON-RCA	CONDO	HOUSE	NR	
31 (55%)	16 (29%)	4 (7%)	2 (4%)	3 (5%)	
	YES	NO	NR	LIMITED	
Have parking available at residence	3 (5%)	39 (70%)	2 (4%)	12 (21%)	

Of the 12 respondents with no car

	YES	NO	NR	MAYBE
Would you rent an over-night space on Beacon Street median	4 (34%)	4 (33%)	4 (33%)	-

Live in the following types of residence

RCA	NON-RCA	CONDO	HOUSE	NR	
3 (25%)	4 (33%)	3 (25%)	-	2 (17%)	
	YES	NO	NR	LIMITED	
Have parking available at					

312 RESPONSES, 5 "NO RESPONSE"

ON SITE PARKING

100

BLOCKS

1/4	-	1
1/2-1	-	7
1	-	20
1-1-1/2	-	1
1-2	-	1
1-1/2	-	3
2	-	16
2-1/2	-	2
2-1/2-3	-	1
3	-	16
3-3-1/2	-	1
3-1/2	-	3
3-4	-	2
4	-	10
4-1/2	-	1
4-5	-	1
5	-	6
6	-	2
8	-	1
10	-	1

YARDS

20	-	3
25	-	2
30	-	1
50	-	2
70	-	1
100	-	8
150	-	1
200	-	1
250	-	1
300	-	1
500	-	1

MINUTES

3/4	-	1
1	-	1
2	-	3
3	-	3
5	-	7
7	-	1
8	-	1
10	-	4
15	-	4
20	-	1

MILES

1/8	-	1
1/4	-	8
1/3	-	4
1/2	-	10
3/4	-	2
1	-	5
2	-	1

FEET

10	-	5
20-40	-	1
50	-	5
100	-	3
200	-	2
300	-	2
600	-	1
1000	-	1

UNQUANTIFIABLE

2 buildings away	-	1
next door	-	1
across street	-	5
down alley & around block	-	1
matter of yards	-	1
300 steps	-	1
far	-	1
short walk	-	2
past 2 houses	-	1
few hundred feet	-	1
few yards	-	1

9 RESPONSES, 1 "NO RESPONSE"

BLOCKS

2-1/2 - 1

MILES

3/4 - 1

1 - 1

1-1/2 - 1

MINUTES

10 - 2

20 - 1

UNQUANTIFIABLE

bus - 1

bike 1 mile - 1

47 RESPONSES, 9 "NO RESPONSE"

BLOCKS

1/2	- 1
1	- 1
1-2	- 1
2	- 2
2+	- 1
3	- 3
3-4	- 1
4-1/2	- 1
5	- 1
5-10	- 1
6	- 1
7	- 2
10	- 1

MILES

1/10	- 1
1/4	- 5
1/2	- 3
1/2-3/4	- 1
3/4	- 2
1	- 7

YARDS

10	- 1
----	-----

MINUTES

5	- 1
10	- 4
10-15	- 1
15	- 1

UNQUANTIFIABLE
MBTA
from Newton
several blocks

APPENDIX B - STANHOPE WAITING LIST STUDY

Method

Applicants on the October 1987 waiting list for overnight parking in all Stanhope-operated Town lots were questioned five months later, in March 1988, to determine what parking arrangements they had made in the intervening period. It was assumed that, in any given month, most of those seeking overnight parking would place their names on the Stanhope waiting list. Of the 122 applicants on the October list, contact was made with all but one. They provided information on the location, monthly fee, duration and distance of their parking space, as well as on their own type of residence, prior knowledge of overnight on-street parking ban, age, length of residence, use of public transportation, and number of occupants and cars per household.

Findings

	# OF	% OF
	RESPONDENTS	
1. Place car parked overnight as of March 1988		
a. Brookline lot	54	45
b. Stanhope lot	20	16
c. Out of town, uses T, occasional Stanhope	6	5
d. Got rid of car, uses T	8	7
e. On-street, occasional Stanhope	6	5
f. Moved or not residents	27	22

2. Price per month: average \$50

<u>24hr Bkln lot</u>			<u>12hr Bkln lot</u>			<u>24hr Bkln garage</u>			<u>24hr Out of town (all but 1 take T)</u>		
#		%	#		%	#		%	#		%
\$ 0	1	3	\$25	1	4	\$ 0	1	11	\$ 0	4	60
24	1	3	30	3	11	40	1	11	24	1	20
30	1	3	35	3	11	50	1	11	55	1	20
35	2	5	45	1	4	60	2	22			
40	5	13	50	5	19	80	1	11	\$13 average		
45	3	8	60	10	38	85	1	11	(7% of total)		
50	9	23	70	1	4	88	1	11			
55	2	5	75	2	8	90	1	11	24hr tickets &		
60	5	13							Stanhope		
65	5	13	\$48 average			\$61 average				#	%
70	2	5	(30% of total)			(10% of total)			\$ 9	2	25
75	1	3							45	1	13
80	2	5							50	1	13
\$52 average									70	3	37
(44% of total)									75	1	13
									\$39 average		
									(9% of total)		

	# OF RESPONDENTS	% OF
3. Distance of parking from home		
Close	73	86
6-8 Blocks (all but one take T to work)	4	5
Over 8 blocks (all but one take T to work)	8	9
4. Use T or walk to work		
Yes	55	65
No	30	35
5. Duration of parking		
24- hour	62	70
12- hour	26	30
6. Type of residence		
Rent Control	50	54
Condo	10	11
Market rental	26	28
Private house	6	7
7. Prior knowledge of ban		
Yes	78	90
No	9	10
8. Age		
20's	54	59
30's	31	34
40's	6	6
60's	1	1

9. Year of moving to Brookline	# OF RESPONDENTS	% OF
1987	60	65
1986	11	12
1985	4	4
1984	2	2
1983	2	2
1982	2	2
1981 and before	12	13
10. Number of people/cars per household		
1/0	3	3
1/1	22	25
2/0	1	1
2/1	15	17
2/2	18	21
3/1	5	6
3/2	11	13
3/3	2	2
4/1	4	5
4/2	2	2
4/3	2	2
4/4	2	2
5/1	1	1
5/2	1	1
5/3	1	1
5/4	1	1
6/3	1	1

These 92 households have 141 cars. Households with one car per adult 52%.

If all households had one car per adult, it would produce 72 more cars.

Conclusions

Need

Twenty-nine percent of the applicants no longer needed overnight parking at all after five months, not having cars any more (7%) or having moved (22%). The population in need of parking is both changeable and in flux.

Within five months all of the remaining applicants had found parking for their cars. Sixty-one percent had found regular, long-term overnight parking in Brookline. Five percent had found irregular parking on the street (in private/alleys or out-of-the-way, unpatrolled public streets) which they supplement with occasional nightly Stanhope parking; and five percent leave their cars at no cost with family or friends out of town, using them in town only on weekends when they take advantage of Stanhope's nightly parking. Within a reasonable amount of time the parking supply is meeting the parking demand.

Cost

The average monthly fee for all parking is \$50. The cost range by type of parking is: 24-hour garage from \$0 to \$90, or an average of \$61; 24-hour lot from \$0 to \$80, or an average of \$52; 12-hour lot from \$25 to \$75, or an average of \$48; 24-hour private and public streets from \$9 to \$75, or an average of \$39; and 24-hour out-of-town site plus Stanhope weekends from \$0 to \$55, or an average of \$13.

There appears to be no price gouging. Heated, full-time, attended garages cost more than open-air, part-time lots. Parkers who suffer the inconvenience of out-of-town parking enjoy the benefit of the lowest cost (along with 24-hour use). Parkers who devise irregular on-street arrangements enjoy the benefit of the next lowest cost (along with closeness to home, and 24-hour use).

Duration

The 30% of the applicants with only 12-hour parking object to having to move their cars every day. In moving their cars onto the street for the day, they are violating another town ordinance which restricts daytime parking to two hours. The major need is not for more 12-hour parking, but for more 24-hour parking.

Distance

Eighty-six percent of the applicants regard their parking site as "close" to their home (each of these parkers gave this specific answer when asked "How far is your parking from your home," and were unable to give a more precise distance in blocks or feet). Of the remaining 14% who do not regard their parking as close, all but two parkers take public transportation to work, so their trips to their cars are irregular. All but one of these parkers are also under 40 years old, so the elderly are not required to walk long distances to their cars.

Public Transportation

Two-thirds of the applicants take public transportation to work. The parking policy has encouraged the use of public transportation, as is its intent.

Age

Fifty-four percent of the applicants are in their twenties; 93% of them are in their twenties and thirties. The people seeking parking are the young, who are just getting installed in town. The middle-aged and elderly are already settled into parking spaces.

Length of Residence

Sixty-five percent of the applicants have only been residents since late 1987, at the time they put their names on the list; 77% have only been residents since late 1986. Parking is a problem of newcomers. Length of residency brings a solution to the problem and a settled parking arrangement.

Knowledge of Ban

Ten percent of the applicants did not know of the ban upon moving into town. Better public information is needed fully to inform potential residents.

Cars per Household

Fifty-two percent of the households do not have one car per adult. Presumably the overnight parking ban is helping to limit the number of cars per household. Without the ban, or with limitless on-street parking, these 95 households would have the potential of producing 72 more cars (or 50% more cars than at present). This outcome, multiplied throughout the town, would alter forever its character.



APPENDIX - C

TOWN of BROOKLINE
Massachusetts

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Town Hall

100 WASHINGTON STREET

BROOKLINE, MASSACHUSETTS 02146

TEL 860-3430

JOHN E. WOODWARD, JR. AICP
Planning Director

TO: Planning Study Committee

FROM: John E. Woodward, Jr., Planning Director

DATE: May 5, 1988

SUBJECT: New Construction and Proposed Projects
Affecting Residential and Commercial
Parking Lots

New Construction and Proposed Projects Affecting Parking Lots

- 1981 - 41 Centre Street (Brewster Terrace) - 104 space public parking lot replaced by 30 unit condominium with 43 parking spaces
- 1982 - 23 Babcock Street (Crystal Manor) - 62 car licensed parking lot replaced by 16 unit condominium with underground parking for 55 cars
- 1983 - 637-651 Washington Street (Washington Place) - 19 car licensed parking lot existed prior to conversion; after conversion, 49 spaces on site, 19 of which are available for overnight use
- 1984 - 3-27 John Street (corner of Pleasant Street) - 54 car parking lot replaced by 2 unit condominium with 13 parking spaces; adjacent lot developed for 21 spaces for Pelham Hall residents
- 1985 - 1303 Beacon Street (Center Place) - 61 car licensed parking lot; after construction of mixed used development with 82 spaces (50 underground and 32 surface) 35 garage spaces available for overnight use
- 1986 - 10-22 Webster Street (Webster Place) - 10 new surface spaces available for overnight use
- 1987 - 20 Englewood Avenue - 62 surface spaces presently rented for overnight use will be incorporated into new parking garage for proposed 17 unit condominium (104 on-site spaces) (approved by Board of Appeals but not yet constructed)
- 1988 - 1241 Boylston Street - at least 12 parking spaces will be made available for overnight use if proposed office building is approved (pending before Board of Appeals)
- 1988 - 930 Commonwealth Avenue - 15 surface parking spaces will be made available for overnight use if proposed office expansion is approved (to be considered by Board of Appeals)

Commercial Sites Replaced by Development (unlicensed lots)

- 1995 - E-2 Target (Brookline Plaza) - gas station and other commercial uses replaced by mixed use development with 150 spaces
- 1987 - 132 Harvard Street - gas station replaced by office building with 27 parking spaces
- 1987 - 227 Fuller Street - 29 commercial spaces to be eliminated after construction of 4 residential units with 8 garages in two-family district (approved by Board of Appeals but not yet constructed)



TOWN of BROOKLINE

Massachusetts

PLANNING DEPARTMENT
TOWN HALL
333 WASHINGTON STREET
BROOKLINE MASSACHUSETTS 02146
(617) 730-2130

JOHN E. WOODWARD JR. AICP
Planning Director

TO: Parking Study Committee
FROM: Planning Department *NZ*
DATE: May 23, 1988
SUBJECT: Response to May 16, 1988 Memo

1. For the buildings listed in our memo of May 5, 1988, if overnight resident use is not cited then, based on our research, it is not being offered. For residential buildings, the number of parking spaces required by the Zoning By-law for the dwelling units proposed is the number that must be made available to the residents of the building. The surplus spaces may be rented to people not resident in the building. Parking for office buildings may be leased to residents after business hours on a dual use basis.
2. Parking Lots Replaced by New Development
Beaconsfield/Tappan/Regent Circle (behind Star Market) - parking lot with about 79 spaces, available from about 1968 to 1982, replaced by 44 townhouses with 71 parking spaces; 1980 Board of Appeals decision contained condition requiring all on-site parking to be limited to use by occupants of the townhouses.

1111 Beacon Street (1980) - 64 space parking lot for adjacent medical office building replaced by 60 unit condominium with 128 garage spaces, 64 of which are required for daytime use, Monday-Friday by office building tenants; about 32 spaces are being rented for overnight use to residents outside the building.
3. Garages Replaced by New Development
Corey Hill Garage (50 Winchester Street) (1978) - garage and 12 car open-air lot replaced by 34 dwelling units with 41 parking spaces for those units.
- 3A. Change in Use of Commercial Garages
Waldo Street Garage - constructed in 1917 as a commercial garage; 1971 file indicates that garage contained 75-80 parking spaces and about 65 were leased for overnight resident use; Boylston Auto Body purchased garage in 1971 and continued to lease spaces for overnight use until about 1975; Bay State Taxi has occupied the premises since 1982.

Lawton Street Garage (#156) - used since 1948 for storage and repair of automobiles and still used as commercial garage; Hamilton Realty purchased property in 1965 and no overnight parking has been available under that ownership.

St. Mary's Street (#151) - owned by Harley Realty and operated as an automotive dealership repair garage; no overnight parking has been available since about 1945.
4. See Section 9.0 of the Zoning By-law, a copy of which is attached.

RE: Report of John E. Woodward, Jr., Planning Director,
to Parking Study Committee, dated May 5, 1988

DATE: May 16, 1988

Relative to Meeting of May 12, 1988, Parking Study Committee

- 1) On the buildings in your report that did not list spaces available for community use, does the fact that this is not stated mean that they do not offer any? Also, how many spaces are owned by people living in the building?
- 2) The Gulf Station, the Regency Bldg. next to the Star Market, and Brewster Terrace all offered temporary parking until the land was built on. The Committee would like to know: Are there other buildings in Brookline that were once temporary lots? They seem to want to count the temporary lots as "lost parking spaces."
- 3) The Committee would like a list of garages that have been converted into buildings. This should include places like: 10 Waldo St., Beaconsfield Rd., Lawton St., 50 Winchester St., and, possibly, St. Mary's Street.
- 4) Is it possible to get a copy of the Town Meeting Warrant that described the new coordinating mechanism between the Bldg. Dept. and the Planning Board?

Shirley Smokler, Secretary
Transportation Dept.

APPENDIX D - STATE FUNDING FOR PARKING FACILITIES

There are a number of state government programs that provide sources of funding for the acquisition and development of off-street public parking facilities.

The state has a special funding program administered by the Department of Administration and Finance; "Off-Street Parking Program" - C 487, Acts of 1980, as amended, that provides grants for the acquisition and development of off-street public parking facilities in 'Commercial Area Revitalization Districts' (CARD Districts).

Several commercial areas in Brookline have the "CARD District" designation and are eligible for application under this state program.

For example, the Washington Square commercial area is located within a CARD District. There are several lots that could be acquired for a daytime and nighttime off-street parking facility. A proposal of this type would be eligible under the Department of Administration and Finance's Off-Street Parking Grant Program.

**List of Additional Materials
Reviewed by the Committee**

Municipal Parking Lot Analysis, 1986

Beacon Street Corridor Parking Study

Final Report, Vanasse, Hanagen, Brustlin, 1987

**Contract Agreement between Brookline and Stanhope
Garage, Inc., 1986**

**Report of the Selectmen's Snow Removal Policy
Committee, 1978**

**Brookline Transportation Board, Summary of Parking
Questionnaire, 1983**

**Residential Parking Survey, Brookline Planning
Board, 1987**